



Computer Science

Opponent(s):

Francisco José Lorite Fernández

Adrián Riquelme Gálvez

Respondent(s):

Adrián Coca Lorente

Pablo Martínez López

musIQal – A music sharing web-site

1 A General Evaluation of the Project

In general the project presents a complete development, defining the necessary concepts to understand each step of the development and the initial propose of making a web page for sharing music is achieved, building a web page for it with all the tools necessaries for it and adding new functionalities. There are only minor misspellings in it but overall a well performed project.

2 Comments on the Project in Relation to the Dissertation

The dissertation reflects exactly the original target proposed. The different steps of the development are understandable through the explained concepts and they are supported by many figures and examples, staying relevant on topic all time and providing to the reader an easy understanding.

2.1 Title

The title reflects perfectly the target of the dissertation, which is to build a music sharing web-site.

2.2 Dissertation Layout

The layout of the report is well organized, using a schematic structure with many sections and subsections for the different concepts. In addition, the text is very legible, presenting a good writing and many figures that support and facilitate the understanding of it.

2.3 Scientific Method

The dissertation presents a good scientific method in terms of explaining every part that composes the whole dissertation through a complete definition of the technologies required for each one.

2.4 Argumentation and Conclusions

The argumentation is generally correct, giving reasons and explanations about why the chosen technologies are necessary. Furthermore, the argumentation is supported by many figures and examples about technologies used. The conclusion reflects the performance of the initial requirements proposed, highlighting the features of the music sharing web-site.

2.5 The Abstract

The abstract provides the reader a complete vision of the project and a good overview what the dissertation is about.

2.6 Language Aspects

The language presented in the dissertation is easy to understand, presenting the ideas in a correct order and legible language. There are few minor misspellings without any importance.

2.7 References and Sources

The authors have used a good variety of references and sources according to the concepts presented. About references we consider that it would be necessary to tag the references used in the text according to the order of appearance.

2.8 General Comments on the Project

The project is really interesting, because it presents some new features that previous systems do not present, adding additional functionalities. In addition, the project is well structured and designed, easy to understand and giving the possibility to collaborate on it in future works.

3 Chapter by Chapter Evaluation of the Dissertation

3.1 Chapter 1

This chapter is well structured, in subsection 1.1 a briefly description of the project is presented, we think it would be convenient for the reader to give more details about the project in this subsection.

The features of the project in 1.2 are enumerated and described clearly, however it would be clearer if the term “suggestions” was defined in the context of suggestions about the song.

Also the term “negotiating” would be appropriate to define in which context is the negotiation

The structure of the dissertation presented in 1.3 is perfectly explained.

3.2 Chapter 2

This chapter is well organized, presenting in it the actual systems in the same field of the dissertation, analysing and comparing them with its system, focusing specially in two of them (Soundcloud and Ubetto), giving a complete explanation also supported with figures.

In addition in this chapter, it is described in subsection 2.2 all the technology used in this project, giving to the reader all the necessities concepts with examples to understand it. In first place, introducing the reader into the HTML standard and later into HTML5 with examples.

For subsection 2.2.2 when is presented the actual on-going battle between web browsers in terms of implementing proprietary codecs, we think that it could be analysed with another section in more detail due to the importance of that instead of being mentioned in this subsection.

In section 2.2 the next technologies are presented clearly and following a flow, in particular, dynamic web pages, ASP.NET, PHP, Javascript, AJAX, JQuery, CSS, C# and SQL.

However, since ASP.NET and PHP are the two most common programming languages in order to achieve dynamic web pages, explained in subsection 2.2.3. we think the sections 2.2.4 and 2.2.5 should be subsections of the subsection 2.2.3.

For subsection 2.2.8 where JQuery technology is explained we recommend to explain in more detail the term “low-level” especially for readers which are not experts in IT field.

In section 2.3 the tools chosen for the project development are presented, giving a great vision to the reader about how they work and a graphical vision of them.

Finally we find really interesting the summary realized to remind the reader the chapter overview.

3.3 Chapter 3

This section describes the details about the program and database design made, explaining all time the reasons for making decisions.

The requirements are clearly presented making clear that are the goals for this project in subsection 3.1 and later it is described the pattern that will be used to implement these requirements, the Model-View-Controller in subsection 3.2.

About this subsection we think that the Model-View-Controller concept should be placed in the background section for being a required concept for the project.

In subsection 3.3 the database design is presented in clearly and easy to the reader, explaining the reason for all tables and the information contained inside them.

In the same way in section 3.4 the program design is explained in detail and well-structured through the different classes that compound it, showing the relation with the database. The explanation is supported by figures and references to the appendix that provides to the reader an instant and complete vision about the design. A summary is done also to remind the reader the concepts explained in the chapter.

3.4 Chapter 4

This chapter describes the basic implementations aspects, divided in 4 subsections. The subsection 4.1 is about main security aspects to take in account; the subsection 4.2 is about audio conversions and mixings, subsection 4.3 is about JQuery Asynchronous requests in order to see the results of operations in real time and finally there is a chapter overview to remind the reader the concepts explained in this chapter.

3.5 Chapter 5

About this chapter, we find really interesting how the authors have shown the appearance of the web-page, showing all the features and services that it offers.

3.6 Chapter 6

We find interesting in this chapter the subsection 6.2 acquired knowledge and subsection 6.3, in order to highlight the benefits of doing the project and things that could be done differently, these points together will be very useful for readers who want to continue or contribute this project.

3.7 Chapter 7

This chapters contains the conclusions about the project in terms of targets achieved and also we find really useful the subsection 7.1, where it is highlighted the possible points to improve for future works.

3.8 General Comments on the Dissertation

In general the dissertation presents a consistent development in terms of the concepts presented, figures and examples, presenting a good flow and being all time focused in the target of the dissertation. Only few minor misspellings must be revised.

4 Final Comments

We have found the project really interesting due to the actual situation of the music market. This system gives the opportunity of sharing and composes music respecting the copyright laws. In addition, the project achieves the initial objectives proposed and adds new features, presenting the project a correct structure and consistency all time, without forgetting any concepts.